

# RCA

REVISTA

# CIENTÍFICA DEL ISTMO

VOLUMEN 4 | NUM. 1

ENERO, 2026

ISSN 2992-6602



VOLUMEN

# 04

NÚMERO 1

# Transferencia negativa en el uso oral de verbos modales del inglés en estudiantes indígenas

*Negative Transfer in the Oral Use of English  
Modal Verbs in Indigenous Students*

*Transferência negativa no uso oral de verbos  
modais do inglês em estudantes indígenas*

N. Acosta García<sup>1</sup>, <https://orcid.org/0009-0000-1312-1694>, [natiaacosta26@gmail.com](mailto:natiaacosta26@gmail.com)

<sup>1</sup> Universidad de Panamá, Panamá.

Autor de correspondencia: [natiaacosta26@gmail.com](mailto:natiaacosta26@gmail.com)

Fecha de recepción: 3 de febrero de 2026

Fecha de aprobación: 2 de marzo de 2026

**Abstract.** The acquisition of English modal verbs constitutes a persistent challenge for Indigenous adolescents in multilingual contexts, particularly when their first languages do not grammaticalize modality in ways comparable to English. This qualitative systematic review aimed to synthesize empirical evidence on negative transfer affecting the oral use of English modal verbs among multilingual Indigenous adolescents. Following PRISMA 2020 guidelines, a structured search was conducted across major academic databases, identifying twelve empirical studies published between 2008 and 2024. The corpus included classroom-based research and ethnographic studies documenting observed oral production, systematic errors, avoidance of modal verbs, and participation patterns in authentic educational settings. Through a qualitative thematic synthesis, recurrent patterns of omission, substitution, and avoidance of English modal verbs were identified, primarily associated with typological distance between languages, interlinguistic influence, and limited metalinguistic awareness. Furthermore, findings indicate that reduced oral participation and communicative hesitation are mediated by sociocultural factors, including language shift, identity positioning, and the marginalization of Indigenous languages in formal schooling. Overall, this review provides an interpretive understanding of negative transfer as a linguistically and socially situated phenomenon and contributes to applied linguistics by elucidating the interaction between grammatical difficulty, oral participation, and sociolinguistic conditions in Indigenous multilingual contexts.

**Keywords.** Negative transfer, english modal verbs, indigenous multilingualism, oral production, applied linguistics.

**Resumen.** La adquisición de los verbos modales en inglés constituye un desafío persistente para adolescentes indígenas en contextos multilingües, especialmente cuando las lenguas maternas no gramaticalizan la modalidad de forma comparable al inglés. El objetivo de esta revisión sistemática cualitativa fue sintetizar la evidencia empírica sobre la transferencia negativa que afecta el uso oral de los verbos modales del inglés en adolescentes indígenas multilingües. Siguiendo las directrices PRISMA 2020, se realizó una búsqueda estructurada en bases de datos académicas de amplio alcance, identificándose 12 estudios empíricos publicados entre 2008 y 2024. El corpus incluyó investigaciones de aula y estudios etnográficos que documentaron la producción oral observada, los errores sistemáticos, la evitación de verbos modales y los patrones de participación en contextos educativos reales. Mediante una síntesis temática cualitativa, se identificaron patrones recurrentes de omisión, sustitución y evitación de verbos modales en la producción oral en inglés, asociados principalmente a la distancia tipológica entre lenguas, a la influencia interlingüística y a una limitada conciencia metalingüística. Asimismo, los hallazgos evidencian que la reducción de la participación oral y la vacilación comunicativa se ven mediadas por factores socioculturales, como el desplazamiento lingüístico, el posicionamiento identitario y la marginación de las lenguas indígenas en la escolarización formal. En conjunto, esta revisión aporta una comprensión interpretativa de la transferencia negativa como un fenómeno lingüístico y socialmente situado, y contribuye a la lingüística aplicada al esclarecer la interacción entre la dificultad gramatical, la participación oral y las condiciones sociolingüísticas en contextos indígenas multilingües.

**Palabras Clave.** Transferencia negativa, verbos modales en inglés, multilingüismo indígena, producción oral, lingüística aplicada.

**Resumo.** A aquisição dos verbos modais em inglês constitui um desafio persistente para adolescentes indígenas em contextos multilíngues, especialmente quando as línguas maternas não gramaticalizam a modalidade de forma comparável ao inglês. O objetivo desta revisão sistemática qualitativa foi sintetizar a evidência empírica sobre a transferência negativa que afeta o uso oral dos verbos modais do inglês entre adolescentes indígenas multilíngues. Seguindo as diretrizes PRISMA 2020, realizou-se uma busca estruturada em bases de dados acadêmicas de amplo alcance, identificando-se doze estudos empíricos publicados entre 2008 e 2024. O corpus incluiu pesquisas de sala de aula e estudos etnográficos que documentaram a produção oral observada, erros sistemáticos, a evitação de verbos modais e padrões de participação em contextos educacionais reais. Por meio de uma síntese temática qualitativa, identificaram-se padrões recorrentes de omissão, substituição e evitação de verbos modais na produção oral do inglês, associados principalmente à distância tipológica entre línguas, à influência interlingüística e a uma consciência metalingüística limitada. Ademais, os achados evidenciam que a redução da participação oral e a hesitação comunicativa são mediadas por fatores socioculturais, como o deslocamento lingüístico, o posicionamento identitário e a marginalização das línguas indígenas na escolarização formal. Em conjunto, esta revisão oferece uma compreensão interpretativa da transferência negativa como um fenômeno lingüístico e socialmente situado e contribui para a lingüística aplicada ao esclarecer a interação entre dificuldade gramatical, participação oral e condições sociolingüísticas em contextos indígenas multilíngues.

**Palavras chave.** Transferência negativa, verbos modais em inglês, multilinguismo indígena, produção oral, lingüística aplicada..

## 1. Introduction

The acquisition of English modal verbs has long been identified as a persistent source of difficulty for learners in multilingual contexts, particularly when English is acquired after the consolidation of other linguistic systems (Odlin, 1989; Ellis, 1994; Palmer, 2001). Modal verbs encode complex epistemic and deontic meanings that require not only control of morphosyntactic form, but also pragmatic sensitivity and sociolinguistic competence in oral interaction (Hoye, 1997; Biber et al., 1999). For learners whose first languages do not grammaticalize modality in ways comparable to English, oral production of modal verbs often remains unstable, manifesting in omission, substitution, or strategic avoidance, especially in spontaneous speech (Ellis, 2006; Collins, 2009; Rozumko, 2019). Consequently, difficulties with modal verbs frequently represent a critical obstacle to effective oral communication rather than isolated grammatical inaccuracies.

These challenges are intensified in Indigenous multilingual contexts, where adolescents typically follow complex linguistic trajectories involving the acquisition of an Indigenous language as a first language, a dominant national language through formal schooling, and English as an additional language (Cenoz, 2003; De Angelis, 2007; Ortega, 2009). Such trajectories increase the likelihood of cross-linguistic influence, including negative transfer, whereby structures, meanings, or communicative strategies from previously acquired languages interfere with the accurate oral use of English modal verbs (Jarvis & Pavlenko, 2008; Gass & Selinker, 2008). Research in applied linguistics has further demonstrated that this interference extends beyond grammatical form to affect learners' oral engagement and willingness to take linguistic risks, particularly when abstract categories such as modality are involved (Housen & Simoens, 2016). From this perspective, negative transfer emerges as both a linguistic and communicative phenomenon.

In Indigenous educational settings, linguistic difficulties cannot be examined in isolation from broader sociolinguistic conditions. Processes of language shift, the marginalization of Indigenous languages in formal schooling, and asymmetrical language ideologies shape the environments in which English is learned and used (Fishman, 1991; Hornberger & López, 1998; May, 2012). Empirical research conducted in Indigenous and minoritized communities has shown that the reduced institutional and social valuation of ancestral languages is often associated with decreased oral participation, communicative hesitation, and avoidance of linguistically complex forms in additional languages (King & Haboud, 2002; McCarty, 2011, 2013). As a result, patterns of avoidance in oral English production must be interpreted within broader sociopolitical and educational conditions that constrain language use in Indigenous classrooms (Hornberger, 2000; Spolsky, 2009).

Ethnographic research has been particularly influential in documenting how identity, participation, and power relations intersect with language learning in multilingual contexts. Norton's longitudinal studies demonstrate that learners' investment in oral participation is shaped by how they position themselves and are positioned by others within educational spaces (Norton, 2000, 2013). From this standpoint, avoidance of oral production, including the use of modal verbs, cannot be interpreted solely as a deficit in linguistic competence, but rather as a strategic response to perceived communicative risk. Similarly, Zentella's (1997) ethnographic work illustrates how everyday language practices, attitudes, and social meaning's structure patterns of language use, underscoring the importance of examining oral production within authentic sociocultural environments.

Within Indigenous multilingual education, ecological approaches further emphasize that language learning is embedded in interconnected sociopolitical, institutional, and community-level

processes (Hornberger, 2003, 2006). Empirical studies grounded in this framework show how Indigenous learners navigate multiple linguistic systems under conditions of unequal prestige, which directly affects opportunities to develop metalinguistic awareness and stable grammatical categories in additional languages (Hornberger & King, 1996; Howard, 2007; Wyman, 2012). These insights are particularly relevant for understanding the acquisition of abstract grammatical notions such as modality, which require sustained exposure, reflection, and meaningful oral use within supportive linguistic environments.

Despite a growing body of research on cross-linguistic influence, third language acquisition, and Indigenous language education, the existing literature remains conceptually and methodologically fragmented. Classroom-based empirical studies have documented recurring patterns of omission, substitution, and avoidance of English modal verbs in oral production (Richards, 2015; Pentón Herrera, 2019; Herrera & Möller, 2020), while ethnographic research has provided detailed accounts of the sociocultural conditions shaping participation, silence, and communicative restraint. However, few studies have systematically integrated these strands of empirical evidence to examine negative transfer in the oral use of English modal verbs as both a linguistic and sociolinguistic phenomenon among Indigenous multilingual adolescents.

This lack of integration constitutes a significant gap in the literature, as it limits the ability to identify consistent empirical patterns and to develop pedagogical responses grounded in the lived realities of Indigenous learners. When grammatical difficulty is examined in isolation from identity, language shift, and educational inequality, there is a risk of attributing persistent oral challenges to individual learner deficits rather than to structurally conditioned learning environments. A qualitative systematic review that synthesizes classroom-based empirical studies and ethnographic research is therefore necessary to

advance a more comprehensive and context-sensitive understanding of negative transfer in Indigenous multilingual education.

In response to this gap, the present study conducts a qualitative systematic review of empirical research examining negative transfer in the oral use of English modal verbs among Indigenous multilingual adolescents. Following PRISMA 2020 guidelines, the review synthesizes evidence from classroom-based studies and ethnographic research to identify recurring patterns in oral production, participation, and avoidance, as well as the linguistic and sociocultural factors reported to influence these phenomena. By integrating empirical findings across methodological traditions, this study seeks to clarify how grammatical difficulty, oral participation, and sociolinguistic conditions interact to shape English learning trajectories in Indigenous multilingual educational settings.

## 2. Methodology

This study adopted a qualitative systematic review design with an interpretive orientation, conducted in accordance with the PRISMA 2020 guidelines (Page et al., 2021). This approach is appropriate in applied linguistics research when the objective is to synthesize empirical evidence to identify recurring patterns, meanings, and explanatory factors, rather than to estimate statistical effects. The review focused on negative transfer in the oral use of English modal verbs among Indigenous multilingual adolescents, integrating linguistic and sociocultural dimensions of language use.

The unit of analysis consisted of empirical studies rather than individual participants. The review included research conducted with Indigenous multilingual adolescents in formal educational contexts. Studies were selected based on predefined inclusion and exclusion criteria designed to ensure conceptual relevance, methodological rigor, and alignment with the research objective.

Eligible studies addressed at least one of the following aspects: the oral use of English modal verbs, negative transfer or cross-linguistic influence, third language acquisition, or multilingual language learning in Indigenous or minoritized populations. Included studies reported empirical data related to oral production, classroom interaction, or sociolinguistic participation. Only peer-reviewed journal articles and indexed book chapters published between 2000 and 2024 in English or Spanish were considered. Theoretical papers, narrative reviews, studies focused exclusively on written language, and publications lacking methodological transparency were excluded.

The literature search was conducted between February and June 2025 across major academic databases, including Scopus, ERIC, Redalyc, SciELO, and Google Scholar. Search strings combined terms related to English modal verbs, negative transfer, cross-linguistic influence, oral production, Indigenous adolescents, and multilingualism, using Boolean operators to refine results. Study selection followed a two-stage procedure: an initial screening of titles and abstracts, followed by full-text review based on the inclusion and exclusion criteria. The selection process was documented using a PRISMA 2020 flow diagram to ensure transparency and replicability.

Data collection relied exclusively on secondary empirical evidence reported in the selected studies. The instruments used to generate the original data included classroom observations, ethnographic fieldwork, analyses of oral interaction, and documented instances of spontaneous spoken language use. No primary data were collected, and no additional instruments were administered by the author.

Given the qualitative nature of the review, no quantitative variables, standardized measurements, or statistical scales were defined. Data analysis was conducted through a qualitative thematic synthesis following the procedures outlined by Thomas and Harden (2008). Reported findings from the included studies were coded inductively, compared across

studies, and grouped into recurrent analytical themes. Analytical categories included omission, substitution, and avoidance of English modal verbs, patterns of oral participation, identity positioning, and sociolinguistic factors influencing oral language use. Themes were refined through iterative comparison to ensure analytical coherence and alignment with the research objective.

Because the study did not involve direct interaction with human participants or the collection of primary data, formal ethical approval was not required. All studies included in the review had previously reported adherence to ethical standards appropriate to their research context. The review was conducted in accordance with principles of academic integrity, transparency, and responsible citation practices.

#### **Methodological control and limitations**

As a qualitative systematic review, the study did not involve experimental manipulation, control groups, or intervention conditions. Methodological control was ensured through the rigorous application of inclusion and exclusion criteria and adherence to PRISMA 2020 reporting standards. The main limitations derive from the methodological quality and reporting practices of the included studies, as well as from the diversity of educational contexts and research designs represented in the corpus. This variability limited direct comparability across studies but was addressed through careful interpretive synthesis.

The review process was documented in sufficient detail to ensure reproducibility. The explicit description of databases, search strategies, selection criteria, and analytical procedures allows other researchers to replicate the review or extend the corpus in future research.

### **3. Results**

The results of this qualitative systematic review are based on the thematic synthesis of twelve (12) empirical studies selected in accordance with the

PRISMA 2020 guidelines. Findings are reported descriptively and organized thematically to reflect recurrent empirical patterns documented across classroom-based and ethnographic research conducted in Indigenous multilingual educational contexts.

**Characteristics of the Studies Included**

The qualitative synthesis included twelve empirical studies conducted in diverse Indigenous

educational settings across Latin America and North America. These studies employed classroom-based and ethnographic research designs and focused on the use of spoken English among Indigenous multilingual adolescents across bilingual and trilingual learning trajectories. The empirical focus included observed oral production, modal verb use, and participation patterns, language shift, identity positioning, and multilingual practices.

**Table 1.** Characteristics of empirical studies included in the qualitative synthesis

<i>Authors &amp; Year</i>	<i>Context / Country</i>	<i>Indigenous Group</i>	<i>Study Type</i>	<i>Participants</i>	<i>Languages Involved</i>	<i>Empirical Focus</i>
<i>Richards (2015)</i>	Rural secondary schools / Mexico	Nahua	Classroom-based	Adolescents	Nahuatl–Spanish–English	Oral modal use
<i>Pentón Herrera (2019)</i>	Public schools / Guatemala	Maya	Classroom-based	Adolescents	Maya–Spanish–English	Modal omission
<i>Herrera &amp; Möller (2020)</i>	Urban schools / Chile	Mapuche	Classroom-based	Adolescents	Mapudungun–Spanish–English	Oral production
<i>Norton (2013)</i>	Urban schools / Canada	Mixed Indigenous	Ethnographic	Adolescents	L1–L2–English	Identity & participation
<i>King &amp; Haboud (2002)</i>	Community schools / Ecuador	Quichua	Ethnographic	Adolescents	Quichua–Spanish–English	Language shift
<i>McCarty (2011)</i>	Reservation schools / USA	Navajo	Ethnographic	Adolescents	Navajo–English	Participation patterns
<i>Wyman (2012)</i>	Community schools / Alaska	Yup’ik	Ethnographic	Adolescents	Yup’ik–English	Silence & risk
<i>Howard (2007)</i>	Andean schools / Bolivia	Quechua	Ethnographic	Adolescents	Quechua–Spanish–English	Language ecology
<i>Boster (2013)</i>	Rural schools / Peru	Quechua	Ethnographic	Adolescents	Quechua–Spanish–English	Oral practices
<i>Zentella (1997)</i>	Urban communities / USA	Latino Indigenous	Ethnographic	Adolescents	Spanish–English	Language attitudes
<i>Hornberger &amp; King (1996)</i>	Andean schools / Peru	Quechua	Ethnographic	Adolescents	Quechua–Spanish–English	Multilingualism
<i>McCarty (2013)</i>	Indigenous schools / USA	Multiple	Ethnographic	Adolescents	Indigenous–English	Oral participation

**Source.** Author’s own elaboration based on the empirical studies reviewed.

### Structural and Typological Patterns of Negative Transfer

Across the reviewed studies, recurrent structural and typological patterns of negative transfer were documented in the oral use of English modal verbs. These patterns were observed in spontaneous oral production, classroom interaction, and communicative tasks involving expressions of obligation, possibility, permission, and uncertainty. Table 2 presents a descriptive overview of the main patterns of negative transfer reported across empirical studies.

**Table 2.** Recurrent patterns of negative transfer in the oral use of English modal verbs

<i>Pattern</i>	<i>Description</i>	<i>Modal Verbs Affected</i>	<i>Oral Manifestation</i>	<i>Empirical Sources</i>
<i>Omission</i>	Absence of modal marking in obligatory contexts	must, should	Bare verb forms without modal auxiliaries	Richards (2015); Pentón Herrera (2019)
<i>Substitution</i>	Replacement of modal verbs with lexical or periphrastic forms	can, may	Use of main verbs to express modality	Herrera & Möller (2020)
<i>Avoidance</i>	Strategic non-use of modal verbs in oral discourse	might, could	Truncated or minimal utterances	Norton (2013); McCarty (2011)
<i>Simplification</i>	Overgeneralization of a single modal form	should	Uniform modal use across contexts	Richards (2015)

**Source.** The author's own elaboration is based on the qualitative synthesis of the reviewed studies.

As shown in Table 2, modal verb omission, substitution, simplification, and avoidance were consistently reported across different Indigenous educational contexts and research designs. These patterns were documented in both bilingual and trilingual learning trajectories.

### Oral Participation and Sociolinguistic Constraints

The reviewed studies also reported sociolinguistic factors associated with reduced oral participation in English learning contexts. These factors shaped

observable communicative behaviors, including hesitation, limited verbal engagement, and strategic avoidance of linguistically complex forms during oral interaction. Table 3 summarizes the main sociolinguistic factors reported across the empirical studies and their documented impact on oral production and classroom participation.

**Table 3.** Sociolinguistic factors mediating oral use of English modal verbs

<i>Sociolinguistic Factor</i>	<i>Empirical Description</i>	<i>Observed Impact on Oral Production</i>	<i>Empirical Sources</i>
<i>Language shift</i>	Progressive displacement of Indigenous languages in formal schooling	Increased hesitation and reduced oral engagement in English	King & Haboud (2002); McCarty (2011)
<i>Identity positioning</i>	Learners positioned as linguistically deficient or marginal	Avoidance of complex grammatical forms such as modal verbs	Norton (2013); Zentella (1997)
<i>Language ideologies</i>	Devaluation of Indigenous languages within institutional contexts	Reduced communicative risk-taking in oral English	Hornberger (2003); McCarty (2013)

**Source.** The author's own elaboration based on the synthesis of ethnographic and classroom-based empirical studies.

As presented in Table 3, language shift, identity positioning, language ideologies, and instructional constraints were recurrently associated with reduced oral participation across diverse Indigenous educational contexts.

## 4. Discussion

The findings of this qualitative systematic review provide convergent empirical evidence that negative transfer in the oral use of English modal verbs among Indigenous multilingual adolescents cannot be understood as a purely structural phenomenon. Rather, the results indicate that grammatical difficulty, oral participation, and sociolinguistic conditions interact systematically to shape learners' oral English use. By integrating classroom-based empirical studies and ethnographic research, this study addresses the research objective of clarifying how negative transfer

operates within Indigenous multilingual educational contexts.

From a linguistic perspective, the recurrent patterns of omission, substitution, simplification, and avoidance of English modal verbs documented across the reviewed studies are consistent with prior research on cross-linguistic influence and the acquisition of abstract grammatical categories in additional languages (Odlin, 1989; Ellis, 1994; Gass & Selinker, 2008). Modal verbs encode epistemic and deontic meanings that are highly context-dependent and pragmatically constrained, which renders them particularly vulnerable to negative transfer when learners' previously acquired languages do not grammaticalize modality in comparable ways (Hoye, 1997; Palmer, 2001; Rozumko, 2019). The consistency of these patterns across bilingual and trilingual learning trajectories suggests that negative transfer in modal verb use functions as a systematic constraint on oral production rather than as isolated learner error.

Beyond grammatical form, the results demonstrate that negative transfer also affects oral participation. The empirical evidence synthesized in this review shows that reduced oral engagement, hesitation, and strategic avoidance frequently accompany modal verb difficulty in Indigenous multilingual classrooms. These findings align with applied linguistics research indicating that grammatical complexity can interact with learners' willingness to take communicative risks, particularly in oral contexts (Housen & Simoens, 2016). In this sense, avoidance of modal verbs emerges not only as a linguistic outcome but also as a communicative strategy shaped by interactional demands within classroom settings.

Ethnographic evidence further illuminates the sociocultural dimensions underlying these patterns. Studies documenting language shift, identity positioning, and unequal language ideologies indicate that Indigenous adolescents' oral participation in English is shaped by broader sociolinguistic conditions rather than by grammatical competence

alone (Hornberger, 2000; McCarty, 2011, 2013). In educational contexts where Indigenous languages are marginalized, learners may experience reduced symbolic legitimacy as speakers, which constrains opportunities for oral experimentation and increases communicative risk. From this perspective, the avoidance of linguistically complex forms such as modal verbs can be interpreted as a socially situated response to unequal language ecologies.

These interpretations are consistent with ethnographic research on identity and language learning, which emphasizes that learners' investment in oral participation is mediated by power relations and positioning within educational spaces (Norton, 2000, 2013). The findings synthesized in this review support the view that silence and reduced oral output should not be interpreted as individual deficits, but rather as strategic responses to interactional, institutional, and sociolinguistic constraints. Similarly, ecological approaches to Indigenous multilingual education highlight that grammatical development is embedded within interconnected community, institutional, and policy-level processes that shape language use and learning opportunities (Hornberger, 2003, 2006).

Taken together, the findings underscore the need to reconceptualize negative transfer in the oral use of English modal verbs as a linguistically and socially situated phenomenon. Instructional approaches that focus exclusively on formal accuracy without addressing participation, identity, and multilingual resources may be insufficient to support sustained oral development. The results of this review point to the importance of pedagogical practices that legitimize Indigenous learners' multilingual repertoires and provide opportunities for explicit cross-linguistic reflection and meaningful oral engagement within supportive educational environments.

## 5. Conclusions

This qualitative systematic review synthesized empirical evidence on negative transfer in the oral use

of English modal verbs among Indigenous multilingual adolescents. By integrating classroom-based studies and ethnographic research, the study fulfilled its objective of clarifying how grammatical difficulty, oral participation, and sociolinguistic conditions intersect within Indigenous educational contexts.

The findings confirm that negative transfer in English modal verb use is a recurrent phenomenon across bilingual and trilingual learning trajectories involving Indigenous languages. Patterns of omission, substitution, simplification, and avoidance were consistently documented in oral production, indicating that modal verbs constitute a persistent area of difficulty in spoken English. Importantly, these patterns emerged systematically across diverse educational settings rather than as isolated grammatical errors.

Beyond structural aspects, the review demonstrates that difficulties with modal verbs are closely associated with reduced oral participation and communicative hesitation. The synthesized evidence indicates that sociolinguistic factors, such as language shift, identity positioning, and the marginalization of Indigenous languages in formal schooling, shape learners' willingness and opportunities to engage orally in English. These findings reinforce the view that oral language development cannot be fully understood without considering the broader sociocultural environments in which learning occurs.

From a theoretical perspective, this study contributes to applied linguistics by conceptualizing negative transfer as a linguistically and socially situated phenomenon. The integration of empirical classroom-

based evidence with ethnographic insights advances research on cross-linguistic influence by demonstrating how grammatical complexity, participation patterns, and language ideologies jointly affect oral language use in Indigenous multilingual contexts.

In pedagogical terms, the findings suggest that instructional approaches focused exclusively on formal accuracy may be insufficient to address persistent oral challenges. Educational practices that recognize learners' multilingual repertoires, promote explicit cross-linguistic reflection, and foster supportive environments for oral participation may more effectively support the development of complex grammatical forms such as modal verbs.

This review is limited by its reliance on the methodological quality and reporting practices of the included studies, as well as the diversity of educational contexts represented in the corpus. Future research could extend this line of inquiry through longitudinal designs, comparative analyses, or the inclusion of additional Indigenous contexts to refine further the understanding of negative transfer in the development of oral English.

Overall, this study underscores the importance of adopting integrated linguistic and sociocultural perspectives when examining English learning trajectories among Indigenous multilingual adolescents. Synthesizing existing empirical evidence provides a foundation for future research and pedagogical innovation to promote more equitable and meaningful oral language development in Indigenous educational settings.

---

## References

- Biber, D., Johansson, S., Leech, G., Conrad, S., & Finegan, E. (1999). *Longman grammar of spoken and written English*. Longman.
- Boster, D. (2013). *Language revitalization in the Andes: Cultural identity and linguistic diversity*. University of Arizona Press.
- Cenoz, J. (2003). The additive effect of bilingualism on third language acquisition: A review. *International Journal of Bilingualism*, 7(1), 71–87. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1367069030070010501>
- Collins, P. (2009). *Modals and quasi-modals in English*.

- Rodopi. <https://doi.org/10.1163/9789042028741>
- De Angelis, G. (2007). Third or additional language acquisition. *Multilingual Matters*. <https://doi.org/10.21832/9781847690052>
- Ellis, R. (1994). *The study of second language acquisition*. Oxford University Press.
- Ellis, R. (2006). Modelling learning difficulty and second language proficiency: The differential contributions of implicit and explicit knowledge. *Applied Linguistics*, 27(3), 431–463. <https://doi.org/10.1093/applin/aml022>
- Fishman, J. A. (1991). Reversing language shift. *Multilingual Matters*.
- Gass, S. M., & Selinker, L. (2008). *Second language acquisition: An introductory course* (3rd ed.). Routledge.
- Herrera, L., & Möller, V. (2020). Oral production challenges in multilingual English classrooms. *Journal of Multilingual Education Research*, 10, 45–62.
- Hornberger, N. H. (2000). Indigenous literacies in the Americas: Language planning from the bottom up. Mouton de Gruyter. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110807189>
- Hornberger, N. H. (2003). Continua of biliteracy. *Multilingual Matters*.
- Hornberger, N. H. (2006). Frameworks and models in language policy and planning. In T. Ricento (Ed.), *An introduction to language policy* (pp. 24–41). Blackwell.
- Hornberger, N. H., & King, K. A. (1996). Language revitalisation in the Andes. *Anthropology & Education Quarterly*, 27(4), 427–451. <https://doi.org/10.1525/aeq.1996.27.4.427>
- Hornberger, N. H., & López, L. E. (1998). Policy, possibility and paradox. *Language in Society*, 27(4), 439–458. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0047404500019978>
- Howard, R. (2007). *Por los linderos de la lengua*. Plural Editores.
- Hoye, L. (1997). *Adverbs and modality in English*. Longman.
- Jarvis, S., & Pavlenko, A. (2008). Cross-linguistic influence in language and cognition. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203935927>
- King, K. A. (2000). Language ideologies and heritage language education. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 3(3), 167–184. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050008667705>
- King, K. A., & Haboud, M. (2002). Language planning and policy in Ecuador. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, 3(4), 359–424. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14664200208668047>
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Sage.
- May, S. (2012). *Language and minority rights* (2nd ed.). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203815373>
- McCarty, T. L. (2011). Language policy and planning in Native America. *Multilingual Matters*.
- McCarty, T. L. (2013). Indigenous youth and bilingual education. *Journal of Language, Identity & Education*, 12(3), 213–219. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15348458.2013.818470>
- Norton, B. (2000). *Identity and language learning*. Longman.
- Norton, B. (2013). *Identity and language learning: Extending the conversation* (2nd ed.). *Multilingual Matters*.
- Odlin, T. (1989). *Language transfer*. Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9781139524537>
- Ortega, L. (2009). *Understanding second language acquisition*. Hodder Education.
- Page, M. J., et al. (2021). The PRISMA 2020 statement: An updated guideline for reporting systematic reviews. *BMJ*, 372, n71. <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.n71>
- Pentón Herrera, L. J. (2019). Oral production challenges in EFL contexts. *International Journal of English Language Teaching*, 6(2), 23–38.
- Richards, J. C. (2015). *Key issues in language teaching*. Cambridge University Press.
- Rozumko, A. (2019). Modality and stance in learner English. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 151, 101–115. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pragma.2019.07.006>
- Spolsky, B. (2009). *Language management*. Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511626470>
- Thomas, J., & Harden, A. (2008). Methods for the thematic synthesis of qualitative research. *BMC Medical Research Methodology*, 8, 45. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2288-8-45>
- UNESCO. (2003). *Language vitality and endangerment*. UNESCO.

Wyman, L. T. (2012). Youth culture, language endangerment, and linguistic survivance. *Multilingua*, 31(3), 321–344.  
<https://doi.org/10.1515/multi-2012-0015>

Zentella, A. C. (1997). *Growing up bilingual*. Blackwell.